| **Student Name:** Boris Cheung |
| --- |

| **Motion**: This House believes that military conscription is illegitimate |
| --- |

| Student spoke for the duration of the specified time frame. | N/A | 1 | 2 | 3 | 4 | **5** |
| --- | --- | --- | --- | --- | --- | --- |
| Student offered and/or accepted a point of information relevant to the topic. | N/A | 1 | 2 | **3** | 4 | 5 |
| Student spoke in a stylistic and persuasive manner (e.g. volume, speed, tone, diction, and flow). | N/A | 1 | 2 | **3** | 4 | 5 |
| Student’s argument is complete in that it has relevant Claims, supported by sufficient Evidence/Warrants, Impacts, and Synthesis. | N/A | 1 | 2 | **3** | 4 | 5 |
| Student argument reflects application of theory taught during class time. | N/A | 1 | 2 | **3** | 4 | 5 |
| Student’s rebuttal is effective, and directly responds to an opponent’s arguments. | **N/A** | 1 | 2 | 3 | 4 | 5 |
| Student ably supported teammate’s case and arguments. | **N/A** | 1 | 2 | 3 | 4 | 5 |
| Student applied feedback from previous debate(s). | N/A | 1 | 2 | **3** | 4 | 5 |
| Competition Score: | 72 | | | | | |
| Rubric  1 - Unobserved.  2 - Student attempt noted. Needs extended teacher support to properly execute skill.  3 - Student effort noted. Can execute skill with minimal teacher input and guidance.  4 - Student can execute skill with little to no prompting.  5 - Student can execute skill without prompting; exceeds expectations for child of that level. | | | | | | |
| Teacher comments:   * We need a better hook. Try to explain exactly what these people are risking and what reward they are likely to receive and why it is not fair. * Try to minimize the random pauses in your speech. There also are a lot of fillers - try to minimize those. * We need a more robust characterization of military conscription. Try to explain the conditions when you have policies supporting military conscription. * Nice identification that people are forced to fight a country's war - try to explain exactly why the country’s agenda and individual’s rights are different things. * Try to minimize random repetitions in your speech. At times your voice gets very soft/ almost inaudible at the end of your sentences. Try to keep your volume consistent. * Nice work on identifying the harms to soldiers after the war is over. Try to explain exactly what causes it and why it is very specifically linked to military conscription. * Your argument on the quality of soldiers going down requires further analysis. Try to explain how willing soldiers can contribute to more effective military operations and more success in that regard. * You also want to compare the protection of larger communities in general as well. When you don’t have military conscription, what are the alternatives the country will explore while entering into a war. * 6:50 | | | | | | |

| **Student Name:** Ishan Harishankar |
| --- |

| **Motion**: This House believes that military conscription is illegitimate |
| --- |

| Student spoke for the duration of the specified time frame. | N/A | 1 | 2 | 3 | 4 | **5** |
| --- | --- | --- | --- | --- | --- | --- |
| Student offered and/or accepted a point of information relevant to the topic. | N/A | 1 | 2 | **3** | 4 | 5 |
| Student spoke in a stylistic and persuasive manner (e.g. volume, speed, tone, diction, and flow). | N/A | 1 | 2 | **3** | 4 | 5 |
| Student’s argument is complete in that it has relevant Claims, supported by sufficient Evidence/Warrants, Impacts, and Synthesis. | N/A | 1 | 2 | **3** | 4 | 5 |
| Student argument reflects application of theory taught during class time. | N/A | 1 | 2 | **3** | 4 | 5 |
| Student’s rebuttal is effective, and directly responds to an opponent’s arguments. | N/A | 1 | 2 | **3** | 4 | 5 |
| Student ably supported teammate’s case and arguments. | **N/A** | 1 | 2 | **3** | 4 | 5 |
| Student applied feedback from previous debate(s). | N/A | 1 | 2 | **3** | 4 | 5 |
| Competition Score: | 72 | | | | | |
| Rubric  1 - Unobserved.  2 - Student attempt noted. Needs extended teacher support to properly execute skill.  3 - Student effort noted. Can execute skill with minimal teacher input and guidance.  4 - Student can execute skill with little to no prompting.  5 - Student can execute skill without prompting; exceeds expectations for child of that level. | | | | | | |
| Teacher comments:   * Try to focus more on why that social contract is fair instead of saying that we signed this invisible contract. * Nice identification of the ideas from the other side. Nice work on explaining that these people receive reciprocal benefits and rewards for participating in the military. * You need to explain exactly why military conscription usually is justified. Here explain what kind of conditions trigger military conscription and what kind of countries do this. * Try to minimize the repetition and pauses in your speech. You tend to repeat a lot of phrases in the middle of your sentences. * You also want to explain why voluntary military service from people is not enough for a state to survive a war. * We also need a lot more responses. Try to show how the right for people to choose or live does not trump over overall protection of the country. * Your idea of social contract needs more nuance to explain why this should include and already includes these kinds of provisions. * 6:33 | | | | | | |

| **Student Name: Jennie** |
| --- |

| **Motion**: This House believes that military conscription is illegitimate |
| --- |

| Student spoke for the duration of the specified time frame. | N/A | 1 | 2 | 3 | 4 | **5** |
| --- | --- | --- | --- | --- | --- | --- |
| Student offered and/or accepted a point of information relevant to the topic. | N/A | 1 | 2 | **3** | 4 | 5 |
| Student spoke in a stylistic and persuasive manner (e.g. volume, speed, tone, diction, and flow). | N/A | 1 | 2 | **3** | 4 | 5 |
| Student’s argument is complete in that it has relevant Claims, supported by sufficient Evidence/Warrants, Impacts, and Synthesis. | N/A | 1 | 2 | **3** | 4 | 5 |
| Student argument reflects application of theory taught during class time. | N/A | 1 | 2 | **3** | 4 | 5 |
| Student’s rebuttal is effective, and directly responds to an opponent’s arguments. | **N/A** | 1 | 2 | 3 | 4 | 5 |
| Student ably supported teammate’s case and arguments. | **N/A** | 1 | 2 | 3 | 4 | 5 |
| Student applied feedback from previous debate(s). | N/A | 1 | 2 | **3** | 4 | 5 |
| Competition Score: | 72 | | | | | |
| Rubric  1 - Unobserved.  2 - Student attempt noted. Needs extended teacher support to properly execute skill.  3 - Student effort noted. Can execute skill with minimal teacher input and guidance.  4 - Student can execute skill with little to no prompting.  5 - Student can execute skill without prompting; exceeds expectations for child of that level. | | | | | | |
| Teacher comments:   * Good illustration of the reality in the military. You also want to contextualize the context of the war and how this makes this entire process unfair. * When you explain that you lose time and sometimes life in the process - try to explain how significant the harm is within military conscription. What kind of assignments are you sent to? Are these assignments legitimate? * Your reasons are a bit repetitive - try to contextualize the alternatives to military conscription more directly. Explain if we will have less wars with less soldier signups. Does it mean the government thinks twice about going to war? * You need to explain why personal priorities are more important than military service. Also within the military as well, you have a range of positions. You need to engage with this context as well. * You need a more robust rebuttal structure.   05:15 | | | | | | |

| **Student Name: Alison** |
| --- |

| **Motion**: This House believes that military conscription is illegitimate |
| --- |

| Student spoke for the duration of the specified time frame. | N/A | 1 | 2 | 3 | 4 | **5** |
| --- | --- | --- | --- | --- | --- | --- |
| Student offered and/or accepted a point of information relevant to the topic. | N/A | 1 | 2 | 3 | 4 | 5 |
| Student spoke in a stylistic and persuasive manner (e.g. volume, speed, tone, diction, and flow). | N/A | 1 | 2 | **3** | 4 | 5 |
| Student’s argument is complete in that it has relevant Claims, supported by sufficient Evidence/Warrants, Impacts, and Synthesis. | N/A | 1 | 2 | **3** | 4 | 5 |
| Student argument reflects application of theory taught during class time. | N/A | 1 | 2 | 3 | **4** | 5 |
| Student’s rebuttal is effective, and directly responds to an opponent’s arguments. | N/A | 1 | 2 | **3** | 4 | 5 |
| Student ably supported teammate’s case and arguments. | N/A | 1 | 2 | **3** | 4 | 5 |
| Student applied feedback from previous debate(s). | N/A | 1 | 2 | **3** | 4 | 5 |
| Competition Score: | 74 | | | | | |
| Rubric  1 - Unobserved.  2 - Student attempt noted. Needs extended teacher support to properly execute skill.  3 - Student effort noted. Can execute skill with minimal teacher input and guidance.  4 - Student can execute skill with little to no prompting.  5 - Student can execute skill without prompting; exceeds expectations for child of that level. | | | | | | |
| Teacher comments:   * Nice work on explaining the needs of the country at the specific situation of the war. Nice contextualization of the lack of volunteers. * When you say the government has any right under this contract - try to show how the resources and safety that government has provided or can continue to provide hinges on this specific implementation of the contract. * You also want to explain the broader context of the war and how you are able to navigate these situations better with voluntary services. Show how it affects whether a country will go to war, will it be responsible and how this works. * You also want to explain how this conscription works. What are the roles that you are required to perform within these roles? Try to show that risking your life is not always the condition. Some countries do it to show that their military is robust, deterring other countries from fighting against them. * Nice work on explaining how other priorities need to be undervalued in war situations and how military conscription provides a better way for people. * 5:37 | | | | | | |